Memorandum



State of New York

November 19, 2019

Mr. Ken Bleiwas Office of the State Comptroller 59 Maiden Lane, 29th Floor New York, New York 10038

Dear Mr. Bleiwas,

This represents the MTA's Third Quarter, 2019, report concerning the status of its gap closing initiatives as required by the NY State Comptroller's Regulation 4, Section 202.5 (c). According to the Regulation, the MTA must report "each quarter, until implemented or rescinded, the status of each gap-closing initiative with a projected value equal to or greater than \$1 million in any given fiscal year, including milestones, impact on staffing, current implementation status, actual savings or revenues to date and projected annual savings or revenues in comparison to Budget and Plan projections."

Attached is a summary of the results of the 3rd Quarter PEG Monitoring Program for 2019, as well as copies of the PEG Monitoring Milestone Reports. The summary shows that the MTA will track gap closing initiatives with an annual value of \$938.8 million. Actual 3rd Quarter savings of \$601.1 million represents 90.1% of the 3rd quarter goal and 64.0% of the planned annual savings.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to call.

Sincerely,

CC:

David Keller Acting Director, Division of Management & Budget

| P. Foye | K. DeDonno |
|-------------|-------------------|
| L. Schwartz | K. Leopold |
| B. Foran | L. Liberto (OSDC) |
| N. Griffith | |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date PEG Monitoring Summary Combined 2012 - 2019

(\$ in millions)

| | | | | | 3rd Quart | er Results (ytd) | |
|-----------------------|------|----------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|--|
| MTA Agencies | Moni | - 2019 tored * Year) | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2012 - 2019 Implemented at end of Quarter |
| | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) |
| New York City Transit | 179 | 804.971 | 581.892 | 515.024 | (52.603) | 88.5% | 64.0% |
| Long Island Rail Road | 140 | 47.154 | 23.579 | 24.732 | 1.153 | 104.9% | 52.4% |
| Metro-North Railroad | 55 | 29.973 | 22.480 | 22.480 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% |
| MTA Bridges & Tunnels | 0 | 23.300 | 13.881 | 13.881 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 59.6% |
| MTA Headquarters | 61 | 26.640 | 19.981 | 19.981 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% |
| Staten Island Rail | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Bus Company | 45 | 6.719 | 5.040 | 5.040 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% |
| MTA CONSOLIDATED | 480 | 938.757 | 666.853 | 601.138 | (51.450) | 90.1% | 64.0% |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date PEG Monitoring Summary 2019 PEGs

(\$ in millions)

| | | | | | 3rd Quart | er Results (ytd) | |
|-------------------------|------|--------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|
| MTA Agencies | Moni | BRPs tored * Year) | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2019 Monitored at end of Quarter |
| | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) |
| New York City Transit * | 78 | 110.155 | 60.780 | 10.742 | (50.038) | 17.7% | 9.8% |
| Long Island Rail Road | 95 | 23.922 | 11.962 | 11.962 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% |
| Metro-North Railroad | 55 | 29.973 | 22.480 | 22.480 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% |
| MTA Bridges & Tunnels | 0 | 23.300 | 13.881 | 13.881 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 59.6% |
| MTA Headquarters | 0 | 6.752 | 5.065 | 5.065 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% |
| Staten Island Rail | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Bus Company | 45 | 6.719 | 5.040 | 5.040 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% |
| MTA CONSOLIDATED | 273 | 200.821 | 119.208 | 69.170 | (50.038) | 58.0% | 34.4% |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date PEG Monitoring Summary 2018 PEGs

(\$ in millions)

| | | | | | 3rd Quart | er Results (ytd) | |
|-------------------------|-------|--------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|
| MTA Agencies | Monit | BRPs tored * Year) | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2018 Monitored at end of Quarter |
| | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) | |
| New York City Transit * | 124 | 13.819 | 10.364 | 9.129 | (1.235) | 88.1% | 66.1% |
| Long Island Rail Road | 45 | 23.232 | 11.617 | 12.770 | 1.153 | >100.0% | 55.0% |
| Metro-North Railroad | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Bridges & Tunnels | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Headquarters | 61 | 19.888 | 14.916 | 14.916 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% |
| Staten Island Rail | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Bus Company | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA CONSOLIDATED | 230 | 56.939 | 36.897 | 36.815 | (0.082) | 99.8% | 64.7% |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date PEG Monitoring Summary 2017 PEGs

(\$ in millions)

| | | | | | 3rd Quart | er Results (ytd) | |
|-------------------------|-------|-------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|
| MTA Agencies | Monit | BRPs ored * Year) | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2017 Monitored at end of Quarter |
| | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) |
| New York City Transit * | 1 | 2.149 | 1.612 | 0.282 | (1.330) | 17.5% | 13.1% |
| Long Island Rail Road | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| Metro-North Railroad | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Bridges & Tunnels | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Headquarters | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| Staten Island Rail | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA Bus Company | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MTA CONSOLIDATED | 1 | 2.149 | 1.612 | 0.282 | (1.330) | 17.5% | 13.1% |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date PEG Monitoring Summary 2012 PEGs

(\$ in millions)

| | | | | | 3rd Quart | er Results (ytd) | | | | | |
|-------------------------|------|-------------------------------|---|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| MTA Agencies | Moni | 2 BRPs itored * I Year) | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2012 Monitored at end of Quarter | | | | |
| | Pos | (\$) | (\$) (\$) (%) (%) | | | | | | | | |
| New York City Transit * | (24) | 678.848 | 509.136 | 494.871 | 0.000 | 97.2% | 72.9% | | | | |
| Long Island Rail Road | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| Metro-North Railroad | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| MTA Bridges & Tunnels | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| MTA Headquarters | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| Staten Island Rail | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| MTA Bus Company | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | | | |
| MTA CONSOLIDATED | (24) | 678.848 | 509.136 | 494.871 | 0.000 | 97.2% | 72.9% | | | | |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date 2019 PEGs (\$ in millions)

E

| | | | | 3rd Quarter results (ytd) | | | | | | |
|----------------|--|-----|-----------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| BRP Tracking # | PEG Name | | BRPs tored * | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2019 Monitored at end of Quarter | | |
| 3 | | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) | | |
| NYCT | | | | | | | | | | |
| NYCT 19-01 BRP | Shop Plan Maintenance Efficiency | 27 | 5.897 | 4.422 | 4.422 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-02 BRP | Track Inspections Savings | 0 | 5.721 | 4.291 | 0.000 | (4.291) | 0.0% | 0.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-03 BRP | Paratransit Rate Reduction Savings | (2) | 4.663 | 3.497 | 0.000 | (3.497) | 0.0% | 0.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-04 BRP | SI Ferry Service Reduction | 6 | 1.000 | 0.750 | 0.000 | (0.750) | 0.0% | 0.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-05 BRP | Priority Initiative Efficiency | 9 | 1.739 | 1.305 | 1.305 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-06 BRP | Depot Maintenance and Cleaning Efficiencies | 38 | 3.788 | 2.841 | 2.841 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-07 BRP | Health & Welfare Savings | 0 | 83.000 | 41.500 | 0.000 | (41.500) | 0.0% | 0.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-08 BRP | OTPS Reductions | 0 | 3.140 | 1.570 | 1.570 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| NYCT 19-09 BRP | Other Savings | 0 | 1.207 | 0.604 | 0.604 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| | Total NYCT BRPs | 78 | 110.155 | 60.780 | 10.742 | (50.038) | 17.7% | 9.8% | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| LIRR | | | | | | | | | | |
| LIRR 19-01 BRP | Operating Funded Capita | 0 | 2.000 | 1.000 | 1.000 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 19-02 BRP | Infrastructure Investment | 0 | 4.155 | 2.078 | 2.078 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 19-03 BRP | LIRR Forward Reductions | 51 | 1.034 | 0.517 | 0.517 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 19-04 BRP | Enterprise Asset Management | 0 | 1.019 | 0.510 | 0.510 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 19-05 BRP | Improve efficiency of right of way maintenance | 44 | 3.214 | 1.607 | 1.607 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 19-06 BRP | East Side Access Operating Efficiencies | 0 | 7.500 | 3.750 | 3.750 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 19-07 BRP | Help Points | 0 | 5.000 | 2.500 | 2.500 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| | Total LIRR BRPs | 95 | 23.922 | 11.962 | 11.962 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| MNR | | | | | | | | | | |
| MNR 19-01 BRP | Re-allocation of Infrastructure Improvement Repairs from Operating to Capita | 0 | 3.538 | 2.654 | 2.654 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| MNR 19-02 BRP | Reductions to Overtime & Fringe | 0 | 4.069 | 3.052 | 3.052 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| MNR 19-02 BRP | Tighter Control and Prioritization of Non-Payroll Expenses | 0 | 12.534 | 9.400 | 9.400 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| | Lower Energy Consumption due to ISO 500001 Requirements and Reducec | 0 | 12.004 | 3.400 | 0.400 | 0.000 | 100.070 | 10.070 | | |
| MNR 19-04 BRP | Car Miles | 0 | 1.938 | 1.454 | 1.454 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| | Maintenance of Equipment Early Reduction of Capital Positions; Potentia | · · | | | | | | | | |
| MNR 19-05 BRP | Furlough of 4-12 Employees | 30 | 3.215 | 2.411 | 2.411 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| | Extend Car/Coach Cleaning Cycle from 92 to 184 days; Eliminate 25 Car | - | | | | | | | | |
| MNR 19-06 BRP | Cleaner Positions and Immediate Furlough of 25 Employees | 25 | 2.679 | 2.009 | 2.009 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| MNR 19-07 BRP | Operating Capital Reduction | 0 | 2.000 | 1.500 | 1.500 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| | Total MNR BRPs | 55 | 29.973 | 22.480 | 22.480 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date 2019 PEGs (\$ in millions)

| | | | | | 3rd Quarter results (ytd) | | | | | |
|---|--|----------|----------------------------|---|---|---|---|--|---------------------------------------|--|
| BRP Tracking # | PEG Name | | | BRPs tored * | "Planned" "Realized" Variance Savings Savings Savings Pav/(Unfav) "Realized" Savings % of 2019 Mo Savings Savings Savings % of 2019 Mo | | | | | |
| B&T B&T 19-01 BRP B&T 19-02 BRP B&T 19-03 BRP B&T 19-04 BRP | Major Maintenance and Bridge Painting Building Services Cashless Tolling Major Maintenance | | 0 0 0 0 | 6.000 1.096 7.534 6.423 | 3.000 0.822 5.274 3.212 | 3.000 0.822 5.274 3.212 | 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 | 100.0% 100.0% 100.0% 100.0% | 50.0% 75.0% 70.0% 50.0% | |
| B&T 19-05 BRP | Routine Maintenance Total B | &T BRPs | 0 0 | 2.247 23.300 | 1.573 13.881 | 1.573 13.881 | 0.000 0.000 | 100.0% 100.0% | 70.0% 59.6% | |
| <u>MTA HQ</u> MTA HQ 19-01 BRP MTA HQ 19-02 BRP | MTA IT Initiatives MTAPD - Homeless outreach overtime Total MTA | HQ BRPs | 0 0 0 | 2.806 3.946 6.752 | 2.105 2.960 5.065 | 2.105 2.960 5.065 | 0.000 0.000 0.000 | 100.0% 100.0% 100.0% | 75.0% 75.0% 75.0% | |
| MTA Bus MTABus 19-01 BRP MTABus 19-02 BRP MTABus 19-03 BRP | Maintenance Hourly Reduction Shop Overhaul Program Express Bus Service Adjustment Total MTB | US BRPs | 11 34 0 45 | 1.145 5.574 0.000 6.719 | 0.859 4.181 0.000 5.040 | 0.859 4.181 0.000 5.040 | 0.000 0.000 0.000 0.000 | 100.0% 100.0% N/A 100.0% | 75.0% 75.0% N/A 75.0% | |
| | Total M | ITA BRPs | 273 | 200.821 | 119.208 | 69.170 | (50.038) | 58.0% | 34.4% | |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date 2018 PEGs (\$ in millions)

| · | | | | 3rd Quarter results (ytd) | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|---|---------|-----------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| BRP Tracking # | PEG Name | | BRPs tored * | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2018 Monitored at end of Quarter | | |
| | | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) | | |
| NYCT | | | | | | | | | | |
| NYCT 18-08 | EAM Reductions | 36 | 5.372 | 4.029 | 4.029 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| NYCT 18-10 | Terminal Car Cleaning | 66 | 5.976 | 4.482 | 4.482 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| NYCT 18-12 | Security - SBS Eagle Team Efficiency | 22 | 2.471 | 1.853 | 0.618 | (1.235) | 33.4% | 25.0% | | |
| | Total NYCT BRPs | 124 | 13.819 | 10.364 | 9.129 | (1.235) | 88.1% | 66.1% | | |
| LIRR | | | | | | | | | | |
| LIRR 18-01 BRP | Anticipated reduced RCM Maintenance with the elimination of the M3s anc the new M9s being under warranty. | 10 | 6.254 | 3.127 | 3.127 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 18-05 BRP | Lower Traction Power Consumption due to lower overall car miles and more | | | | | | | | | |
| | aggressive review of PSE&G and NYPA Billings | 0 | 2.153 | 1.077 | 2.230 | 1.153 | >100.0% | >100.0% | | |
| LIRR 18-12 BRP | Fleet Maintenance Initiatives | 10 | 13.068 | 6.534 | 6.534 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| LIRR 18-14 BRP | Eliminate Administration Positions | 25 | 1.757 | 0.879 | 0.879 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 50.0% | | |
| | Total LIRR BRPs | 45 | 23.232 | 11.617 | 12.770 | 1.153 | >100.0% | 55.0% | | |
| MNR | NONE | | | | | | | | | |
| <u></u> | Total MNR BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| B&T | NONE | | | | | | | | | |
| <u></u> | Total B&T BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| MTA HQ | | | | | | | | | | |
| MTA HQ 18-02 BRP | Reduction of Consultant Usage and Software Need | 0 | 7.148 | 5.361 | 5.361 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% | | |
| MTA HQ 18-05 BRP MTA HQ 18-06 BRP | Excess Genius Challenge Fundinc MTA IT Vacancies | 0 61 | 5.100 7.640 | 3.825 5.730 | 3.825 5.730 | 0.000 0.000 | 100.0% 100.0% | 75.0% 75.0% | | |
| MIA HQ 18-00 BRP | Total MTAHQ BRPs | | 7.640 19.888 | 5.730 14.916 | 5.730 14.916 | 0.000 | 100.0% | 75.0% N/A | | |
| | | 51 | 10.000 | 14.010 | 14.010 | 0.000 | 100.070 | 11/7 | | |
| MTA Bus | NONE | | | | | | | | | |
| | Total MTBUS BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| | Total MTA BRPs | 230 | 56.939 | 36.897 | 36.815 | (0.082) | 99.8% | 64.7% | | |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date 2017 PEGs (\$ in millions)

| | | | | | 3rd Quarter results (ytd) | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------|-----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|--|--|
| BRP Tracking # | PEG Name | 2017 BRPs Monitored * | | | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2017 Monitored at end of Quarter | | |
| | | | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) | | |
| <u>NYCT</u> NYCT 17-05 BRP | Administrative & OTPS Savings | Total NYCT BRPs | 1 1 | 2.149 2.149 | 1.612 1.612 | 0.282 0.282 | (1.330) (1.330) | 17.5% 17.5% | 13.1% 13.1% | | |
| LIRR | NONE | Total LIRR BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| <u>MNR</u> | NONE | Total MNR BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| <u>B&T</u> | NONE | Total B&T BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| <u>MTA HQ</u> | NONE | Total MTAHQ BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| <u>MTA Bus</u> | NONE | Total MTBUS BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A | | |
| | | Total MTA BRPs | 1 | 2.149 | 1.612 | 0.282 | (1.330) | 17.5% | 13.1% | | |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 3rd Quarter 2019 Year-To-Date 2012 PEGs (\$ in millions)

| | | | | | | | 3rd Qua | rter results (ytd) | |
|------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------------|---------|---------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------------|--|---------------------------------------|
| BRP Tracking # | | PEG Name | 2012 BRPs Monitored * | | "Planned" Savings | "Realized" Savings | Variance Fav/(Unfav) | "Realized" Savings as % of "Planned" Savings | % of 2012 Monitored at end of Quarter |
| | | | Pos | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (\$) | (%) | (%) |
| NYCT NYCT 12-01 BRP | Paratransit Additonal Savings | Total NYCT BRPs | (24) (24) | | 509.136 509.136 | 494.871 494.871 | 0.000 0.000 | 97.2% 97.2% | 72.9% 72.9% |
| <u>LIRR</u> | NONE | Total LIRR BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| MNR | NONE | Total MNR BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| <u>B&T</u> | NONE | Total B&T BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| <u>MTA HQ</u> | NONE | Total MTA HQ BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| <u>MTA Bus</u> | NONE | Total MTA Bus BRPs | 0 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | N/A | N/A |
| | | Total MTA BRPs | (24) | 678.848 | 509.136 | 494.871 | 0.000 | 97.2% | 72.9% |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 2019 NYCT PEG Monitoring Program 3rd Quarter 2019 results

In 2019, 14 PEG's are being monitored with a full-year savings of 179 positions and \$805.0 million.

Results through the third quarter show that \$515.0 million or 88.5% of the planned BRP reductions of \$581.9 million were realized and 175 positions were reduced. Additionally, 64.0% of the planned full-year savings were realized in the second quarter.

The following PEG's did not meet the 3rd quarter savings target:

• 12-01 Paratransit Additional Savings

• Savings for 3rd Quarter were not achieved due to timing, however, anticipate 100% savings by year-end.

• 17-05 Administrative & OTPS Savings

• Savings not achieved in 1st, 2nd, or 3rd Quarter, largely due to overruns in cash discounts.

• 18-10 Terminal Car Cleaning

Initiative was partially achieved as 66 positions were removed from the October 2018 pick. The remaining 25 positions will not be eliminated and will be adjusted in the July 2019 Financial Plan.

• 18-12 Security - SBS Eagle Team Efficiency

• Security continues to streamline fare enforcement operations. Did not achieve savings in the 2nd or 3rd quarter.

• 18-16 Eliminate Police Fare Evasion Overtime

• Savings will not be achieved and was removed (adjusted) in the July 2019 Financial Plan. No longer being tracked.

• 19-02 Track Inspection Savings

Initiative savings are in process but are delayed. Positions reduced have been eliminated from the budget, incumbents will be reduced via attrition, Division of Track has 66 excess supervisory and hourly incumbents as of March YTD. Savings not achieved in 1st, 2nd, or 3rd Quarter.

• 19-03 Paratransit Rate Reduction Savings

Initiative assumes that competitive pressures during the upcoming (second quarter 2019) primary contract bidding process will result in winning bids that are lower than current high cost carriers. Nine of the thirteen existing contracts have been extended to accommodate the time needed to review/assess contract bids. Contract terms for remainder of the thirteen contracts have not been extended as they are scheduled to expire mid-year 2019 through 2020. Request for Proposal (RFP) for new contracts under review by Procurement Selection Committee. Anticipated awarding contracts by end of 2019. Savings not achieved in 1st, 2nd, or 3rd Quarter

• 19-04 SI Ferry Service Reduction

• Service reduction was restored in the November Financial Plan. Savings not achieved in 1st, 2nd, or 3rd Quarter.

• 19-07 Health & Welfare Savings

• Savings not achieved in the 3rd Quarter due to the timing of the RFP process.

MTA New York City Transit

2012 Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actual Results through September)

PEG Name: Paratransit Additional Savings

Description: Savings projections reflect an annual trip growth rate of 5% in 2020 and beyond. The combined impact of reduced trip levels and the continued diversion of trips to lower cost taxi/voucher service favorably affects costs for transportation and fuel. Insurance costs are also lower as NYCT's dedicated fleet is smaller and a significant number of trips are routed towards taxi/voucher services. This BRP has been adjusted to reflect additional costs associated with E-hail/TNC service, which has resulted in increased trip demand and trip growth.

Status: Savings for 3rd Quarter were achieved, however September YTD savings were not achieved. Anticipate savings by year-end.

VALUE (\$ in millions):

| | 20 | 015 | | 2016 | | 2017 | | 2018 | |)19 |
|----------------|---------|------|---------|------|---------|------|---------|------|---------|------|
| | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | 288.908 | (29) | 422.169 | (29) | 450.410 | (22) | 473.577 | (24) | 678.848 | (24) |
| | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | 1 |

| CRITICAL TASKS | & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|----------------|---|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| July Plan 2014 | added additional savings to be captured in the 3rd quarter 2014 | | 7/1/2014 | |
| - | added additional savings to be captured in the 4th quarter 2014 | | 11/1/2014 | |
| July Plan 2015 | added additional savings to be captured in the 3rd quarter 2015 | | 7/1/2015 | |
| July Plan 2016 | added additional savings to be captured in the 3rd quarter 2016 | | 7/1/2016 | |
| July Plan 2017 | added additional savings to be captured in the 3rd quarter 2017 | | 7/1/2016 | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------------------------------|--------|---------|---------|---------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|-----------|-----------|-----------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 56.571 | 678.848 |
| Actual/Proj. | 59.05 | 57.348 | 56.367 | 51.355 | 48.885 | 51.592 | 50.196 | 57.827 | 62.256 | | | | 494.871 |
| Month Var. | 2.476 | 0.777 | (0.203) | (5.216) | (7.686) | (4.979) | (6.375) | 1.256 | 5.685 | (56.571) | (56.571) | (56.571) | (183.977) |
| YTD Var. | 2.476 | 3.253 | 3.050 | (2.166) | (9.852) | (14.831) | (21.206) | (19.950) | (14.265) | (70.836) | (127.407) | (183.977) | (183.977) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| Fully Implemented (Yes/No): | No |

NYCT 12-01

Tracking No.

MTA New York City Transit

2017 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actual Results through September)

PEG Name: Administrative & OTPS Savings

PEG Description: This initiative reflects full and part time position reductions in the Human Resources, System Safety and Operations Planning divisions. In addition, the initiative also reflects price discounts gained from rapid invoice payments as well as reduced contractual costs through more effective management in the Materiel, Human Resources and Corporate Communications departments.

PEG Status: Savings not achieved in 1st, 2nd, or 3rd Quarter, largely due to overruns in cash discounts. NYCT investigating cause of the decline in cash discounts.

PEG VALUE (\$ in millions):

| | | | 17 | 201 | 8 | 20 | 19 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 21 |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-17 | 1.758 | 2 | 2.275 | 2 | 2.275 | 2 | 2.275 | 2 | 2.275 | 2 |
| | Nov-17 | | | 2.149 | 1 | 2.149 | 1 | 2.149 | 1 | 2.149 | 1 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

Quarterly

No

| CRITICAL TASKS & | MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------|-------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 7/1/2017 | | Jul-17 | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------------------------------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | | |
| Plan | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.180 | 2.150 | | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.103 | 0.103 | 0.103 | 0.133 | 0.133 | 0.133 | (0.142) | (0.142) | (0.142) | | | | 0.282 | | |
| Month Var. | (0.076) | (0.076) | (0.076) | (0.046) | (0.046) | (0.046) | (0.321) | (0.321) | (0.321) | (0.179) | (0.179) | (0.180) | (1.868) | | |
| YTD Var. | (0.076) | (0.152) | (0.228) | (0.274) | (0.320) | (0.367) | (0.688) | (1.009) | (1.330) | (1.509) | (1.688) | (1.868) | (1.868) | | |

Frequency of Update to Actuals: PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: Tracking No. NYCT 17-05

Tracking No. N

NYCT 18-08

| PEG Name: | EAM Reductions |
|------------------|--|
| PEG Description: | The budget includes growth for EAM annually. As there are fewer incumbents than currently budgeted, savings results from slowing the program's growth. The budget retains room for filling current vacancies and future growth of 22% by 2020. |

PEG Status: Savings achieved in the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd quarter. Positions have been eliminated from the budget.

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 2.805 | 16 | 5.372 | 36 | 5.879 | 36 | 5.879 | 36 | 5.879 | 36 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-18 | | Jan-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 5.372 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | 0.448 | | | | 4.029 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.448) | (0.448) | (0.448) | (1.343) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.448) | (0.895) | (1.343) | (1.343) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No.

NYCT 18-10

PEG Name: Terminal Car Cleaning

PEG Description: This proposal is to reduce second terminal car cleaning staff and trim night staffing at the first terminal at certain locations.

PEG Status: Initiative was partially achieved as 66 positions were removed from the October 2018 pick. The remaining 25 positions will not be eliminated and will be adjusted in the July 2019 Financial Plan. Savings achieved in the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd quarter against revised PEG.

| | | 20 | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 21 | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 3.746 | 91 | 8.358 | 91 | 8.358 | 91 | 8.358 | 91 | 8.358 | 91 |
| | Jul-19 | | | 5.976 | 66 | 5.976 | 66 | 5.976 | 66 | 5.976 | 66 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jul-18 | Oct-18 | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 5.976 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | 0.498 | | | | 4.482 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.498) | (0.498) | (0.498) | (1.494) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.498) | (0.996) | (1.494) | (1.494) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. N

NYCT 18-12

PEG Name: Security - SBS Eagle Team Efficiency

- PEG Description: Historically, SBS eagle team staffing was added by route. In an effort to streamline fare enforcement, Security has moved to a borough based plan. Security will reduce three teams without a significant increase in expected fare evasion. Each team consists of 7 positions 6 Special Inspectors + 1 Supervisor.
- PEG Status: Savings achieved in the 1st quarter. Security continues to streamline fare enforcement operations. Did not achieve savings in 2nd quarter nor the 3rd quarter.

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 1.626 | 22 | 2.471 | 22 | 2.471 | 22 | 2.471 | 22 | 2.471 | 22 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-18 | | Jan-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | 2.471 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.206 | 0.206 | 0.206 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.618 | |
| Month Var. | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | (0.206) | (0.206) | (0.206) | (0.206) | (0.206) | (0.206) | (0.206) | (0.206) | (0.206) | (1.853) | |
| YTD Var. | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | (0.206) | (0.412) | (0.618) | (0.823) | (1.029) | (1.235) | (1.441) | (1.647) | (1.853) | (1.853) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. NY

NYCT 18-16

PEG Name: Eliminate Police Fare Evasion Overtime

PEG Description: Since 1995 NYCT has reimbursed the NYPD \$4.0M annually for extra fare abuse patrols in the subway. Funding was reduced to \$3.6M due to budget constraints after the 2008 recession, though restored to \$4.0M in 2010.

PEG Status: Savings will not be achieved. This BRP was restored in the July 2019 Financial Plan.

Quarterly N/A

| | | 201 | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 21 | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 2.000 | | 4.000 | | 4.000 | | 4.000 | | 4.000 | |
| | Jul-19 | 0.000 | | 0.000 | | 0.000 | | 0.000 | | 0.000 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jul-18 | Jan-19 | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | |
| Actual/Proj. | - | - | - | - | - | - | | | | | | | - | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: |
|---------------------------------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: |

Tracking No. N

NYCT 19-01

PEG Name: Shop Plan Maintenance Efficiency

PEG Description: This program will extend the shop program cycle from 4-year and 8-year maintenance cycles to mid-life maintenance (6-year cycle) for certain fleets.

PEG Status: Savings achieved in the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd quarter.

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 20 | 20 | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 1.846 | 10 | 5.896 | 27 | 5.833 | 27 | 5.810 | 27 | 5.827 | 27 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-18 | | Jan-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | MONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 5.896 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | 0.491 | | | | 4.422 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.491) | (0.491) | (0.491) | (1.474) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.491) | (0.983) | (1.474) | (1.474) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. NY

NYCT 19-02

PEG Name: Track Inspections Savings

- PEG Description: A pilot program on approximately 1/3 of the system will reduce manual Track Inspections from 2x to 1x weekly, and add a camera equipped TGC run performing video track inspection. Further, with the installation of Continuous Welded Rail (CWR) in critical corridors, special inspections are no longer needed.
- PEG Status: Initiative savings are in process but are delayed. Positions reduced have been eliminated from the budget, incumbents will be reduced via attrition. Division of Track has 66 excess supervisory and hourly incumbents as of March YTD. **Savings not** achieved in the 1st, 2nd and 3rd quarter.

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 0.000 | | 5.721 | 53 | 5.721 | 53 | 5.721 | 53 | 5.721 | 53 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | NONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 5.721 |
| Actual/Proj. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | | | | - |
| Month Var. | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (0.477) | (5.721) |
| YTD Var. | (0.477) | (0.954) | (1.430) | (1.907) | (2.384) | (2.861) | (3.337) | (3.814) | (4.291) | (4.768) | (5.244) | (5.721) | (5.721) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. NYCT

NYCT 19-03

PEG Name: Paratransit Rate Reduction Savings

PEG Description: Historically, NYCT provided the bulk of registrant trips through subcontracts with Primary vendors. These vendors essentially function as mini-transportation companies and carry a significant amount of fixed cost overhead stemming from administrative functions that support transportation operations. For several years NYCT has sought to reduce costs by using a multi-modal platform to provide registrant rides through lower cost providers. As such, a significant number of registrant rides are currently performed by Voucher/Brokered trips using car service companies and accessible taxis and E-Hail service providers. The successful shift of registrant trips from Primary providers to lower cost providers (Brokered, Taxi and E-Hail companies) creates an opportunity to limit or eliminate some of the higher cost Primary service providers.

PEG Status: Initiative assumes that competitive pressures during the upcoming (second/third quarter 2019) primary contract bidding process will result in winning bids that are lower than current high cost carriers. Nine of the thirteen existing contracts have been extended to accomodate the time needed to review/assess contract bids. Contract terms for remainder of the thirteen contracts have not been extended as they are scheduled to expire mid-year 2019 through 2020. Request for Proposal (RFP) for new contracts under review by Procurement Selection Committee. Anticipated awarding contracts by end of 2019. **Savings not achieved in 1st, 2nd, and 3rd quarter.**

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 20 | 21 | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|---------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | (0.127) | (2) | 4.663 | (2) | 9.613 | (2) | 9.613 | (2) | 9.613 | (2) |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jul-19 | | Jul-19 |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | MONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 0.389 | 4.663 |
| Actual/Proj. | - | - | - | - | - | - | | | | | | | - |
| Month Var. | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (0.389) | (4.663) |
| YTD Var. | (0.389) | (0.777) | (1.166) | (1.554) | (1.943) | (2.332) | (2.720) | (3.109) | (3.497) | (3.886) | (4.274) | (4.663) | (4.663) |

Quarterly No

Tracking No. N

NYCT 19-04

PEG Name: SI Ferry Service Reduction

- PEG Description: When NYC DOT increased Staten Island Ferry service from 1 trip to 2 trips per hour during overnight hours, NYCT increased bus service to meet the ferry schedule; however ridership has been very low on that service. This proposal reverts bus service back to one per hour.
- PEG Status: No decision from Senior Management on implementation date of Staten Island bus service to the ferry reduction. As part of the November 2019 Financial Plan, the service reduction was restored.

| | | 201 | 18 | 2019 | | 2020 | | 20 | 21 | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 0.546 | 6 | 1.144 | 9 | 1.144 | 9 | 1.144 | 9 | 1.144 | 9 |
| | Nov-18 | 0.000 | 0 | 1.000 | 6 | 1.000 | 6 | 1.000 | 6 | 1.000 | 6 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | Apr-19 | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | MONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 0.083 | 1.000 |
| Actual/Proj. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | | | | - |
| Month Var. | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (0.083) | (1.000) |
| YTD Var. | (0.083) | (0.167) | (0.250) | (0.333) | (0.417) | (0.500) | (0.583) | (0.667) | (0.750) | (0.833) | (0.917) | (1.000) | (1.000) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No.

NYCT 19-05

PEG Name: Priority Initiative Efficiency

PEG Description: The priority initiative program implemented numerous technology upgrades to the subway fleet, including display screens and USB ports for device charging on board. Additional maintenance resources were included as investment. This initiative reduces the maintenance investment, by incorporating maintenance requirements into the subway car's regular inspection. In addition, USB were not installed in subway cars.

PEG Status: Savings were achieved by eliminating budgeted positions and incorporating function in regular car inspection.

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 0.821 | 9 | 1.739 | 9 | 1.739 | 9 | 1.739 | 9 | 1.739 | 9 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | Bate | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 1.739 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | 0.145 | | | | 1.305 |
| Month Var. | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | (0.145) | (0.145) | (0.145) | (0.434) |
| YTD Var. | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.001 | 0.001 | 0.001 | (0.144) | (0.289) | (0.434) | (0.434) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. N

NYCT 19-06

PEG Name: Depot Maintenance and Cleaning Efficiencies

PEG Description: With the retirement of aging buses and delivery of new buses, NYCT is benefiting from improved fleet reliabilities and efficiencies.

PEG Status: Savings achieved in the 1st, 2nd, and 3rd quarter.

| | | 201 | 8 | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 1.846 | 10 | 3.788 | 38 | 3.788 | 38 | 3.788 | 38 | 3.788 | 38 |
| Revised Plan: | Jul-18 | 0.000 | | 3.788 | 38 | 3.788 | 38 | 3.788 | 38 | 3.788 | 38 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 3.788 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | 0.316 | | | | 2.841 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.316) | (0.316) | (0.316) | (0.947) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.316) | (0.631) | (0.947) | (0.947) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

PEG Name: Health & Welfare Savings

PEG Description: Health & welfare savings are being realized in prescription drugs and medical claims contracts put in place through a competitive procurement process.

PEG Status: Did not achieve 3rd quarter savings.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|--------|------|--------|------|--------|------|---------|------|---------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-19 | 83.000 | 0 | 90.400 | 0 | 97.441 | 0 | 105.031 | | 113.214 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2019 Identify Savings | Jul-19 | | Jul-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | - | - | - | - | - | - | 13.833 | 13.833 | 13.833 | 13.833 | 13.833 | 13.833 | 83.000 | |
| Actual/Proj. | | | | | | | - | - | - | | | | - | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | (13.833) | (13.833) | (13.833) | (13.833) | (13.833) | (13.833) | (83.000) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | (13.833) | (27.667) | (41.500) | (55.333) | (69.167) | (83.000) | (83.000) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. NYCT 19-07

Tracking No. NY

NYCT 19-08

PEG Name: OTPS Reductions

PEG Description: Various OTPS reductions including, renewable natural gas rebate, budget rightsizing of tires and tubes, network redesign, contract guard coverage, janitorial, office supplies and other miscellaneous budgets.

PEG Status: Achieved 3rd quarter OTPS savings associated with Bus Plan Initiatives in Department of Buses.

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-19 | 3.140 | 0 | 8.647 | 0 | 7.807 | 0 | 7.807 | 0 | 7.807 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2019 Identify Savings | Jul-19 | | Jul-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.523 | 0.523 | 0.523 | 0.523 | 0.523 | 0.523 | 3.140 |
| Actual/Proj. | | | | | | | 0.523 | 0.523 | 0.523 | | | | 1.570 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.523) | (0.523) | (0.523) | (1.570) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.523) | (1.047) | (1.570) | (1.570) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. NY

NYCT 19-09

| PEG Name: | Other Savings |
|------------------|--|
| PEG Description: | As a result of planned capital program work, temporary stations closures will result in savings. Also includes other savings in the Controller's Office and OMB effective January 2020 |

PEG Status: Achieved 3rd quarter labor savings associated with temporary stations closures in Division of Stations.

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-19 | 1.207 | 0 | 1.471 | -20 | 0.599 | 0 | 0.599 | 0 | 0.599 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2019 Identify Savings | Jul-19 | | Jul-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.201 | 0.201 | 0.201 | 0.201 | 0.201 | 0.201 | 1.207 |
| Actual/Proj. | | | | | | | 0.201 | 0.201 | 0.201 | | | | 0.604 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.201) | (0.201) | (0.201) | (0.604) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.201) | (0.402) | (0.604) | (0.604) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 2019 LIRR BRP Monitoring Program 3rd Quarter 2019 results

In 2019, 11 BRP's are being monitored with a full-year savings of 140 positions and \$47.2 million.

Results through the third quarter show that \$36.5 million or 103.3% of the planned BRP reductions of \$35.4 million were realized and 25 positions were reduced. Additionally, 77.4% of the planned full-year savings were realized through the third quarter.

At year-end, savings for the monitored BRP is projected to be \$48.3 million or 102.4% of the planned reductions and 140 positions will be reduced.

Tracking No. LIRR 18-01

PEG Name: Anticipated reduced RCM Maintenance with the elimination of the M3s and the new M9s being under warranty.

- PEG Description: The M3 fleet will be decommissioned. Other than FRA mandated RCM efforts, preventative maintenance efforts will be significantly decreased due to running systems/components to failure.
- PEG Status: Due to the delay in the M-9A procurement, the decision was made to maintain 80 of the 143 M3s still operating through 2024.Overall savings are still expected to be achieved as the LIRR will rebalance other elements of its base and future fleet maintenance requirements. This rebalancing will take place as part of the July 2019 Financial Plan.

| | | 20 | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 21 | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-17 | 2.245 | | 2.245 | | 2.245 | | 2.245 | | 2.245 | |
| Revise | Jul-18 | 4.245 | | 6.254 | 10 | 6.251 | 10 | 6.284 | 10 | 6.284 | 10 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| | Date | Date | Date |
| Jul-17 Identify Savings | Jul-17 | | Jul-17 |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 6.254 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | 0.521 | | | | 4.691 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.52) | (0.52) | (0.52) | (1.56) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.52) | (1.04) | (1.56) | (1.56) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

PEG Name: Lower Traction Power Consumption due to lower overall car miles and more aggressive review of PSE&G and NYPA Billings

- PEG Description: Over the last several years, the internal utility management group has been aggressively reviewing all billings and consumption estimates by the power providers. This has results in significant one-time and ongoing savings. In addition, due to significant capital activity over the next several years along the Right of Way, there will be reduced weekend and weekday off peak revenue service car miles resulting in additional savings.
- PEG Status: Savings associated with lower revenue car miles are being achieved. \$1.0 million in savings associated with a specific billing dispute that was not finalized at the end of 2018 has been resolved and has been received in March 2019.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2018 | | 20 | 2019 | | 2020 | | 21 | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 2.119 | | 2.153 | | 2.221 | | 2.297 | | 2.297 | |
| Revised | Nov-18 | 3.119 | | 2.153 | | 2.221 | | 2.297 | | 2.297 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Jul-18 Identify Savings | Jan-18 | | Jan-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|-------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 2.153 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.179 | 0.179 | 1.179 | 0.332 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | 0.179 | | | | 2.768 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | 1.000 | 0.153 | - | - | - | - | - | (0.179) | (0.179) | (0.179) | 0.615 | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | 1.000 | 1.153 | 1.153 | 1.153 | 1.153 | 1.153 | 1.153 | 0.974 | 0.794 | 0.615 | 0.615 | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly Yes

PEG Name: Fleet Maintenance Initiatives

PEG Description: Further material savings identified due to high MDBF of M7 fleet. Certain reliability maintenance and modification activities will be "stretched" over a greater number of years including M7 Phase 3 Truck Program, M7 Phase 4 Door Program, 15 year DM overhaul. Management and craft positions will be reduced. Positions reduced through attrition.

PEG Status: Savings on Target. RCM programs adjusted. No impact on MDBF identified.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|--------|------|--------|------|--------|------|--------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 3.731 | 4 | 13.068 | 10 | 16.892 | 10 | 16.151 | 10 | 16.183 | 10 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Sep-18 | | Sep-18 |

| MONTHLY CASH | /ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 13.068 |
| Actual/Proj. | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | 1.089 | | | | 9.801 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (1.089) | (1.089) | (1.089) | (3.267) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (1.089) | (2.178) | (3.267) | (3.267) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly Yes Tracking No. LIRR 18-12

PEG Name: Eliminate Administration Positions

PEG Description: Eliminate administrative positions in the Stations, Engineering, Service Planning, Department of Project Management, Public Affairs, Procurement, Human Resource, Labor Relations, Management and Budget, Training, Controller, Process Re-engineering and VP CFO departments. In addition, the funding for the intern program has been reduced by half.

PEG Status: Savings achieved. Positions eliminated. No paid interns in 2019.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 201 | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 21 | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 0.905 | 5 | 0.920 | 5 | 0.938 | 5 | 0.953 | 5 | 0.968 | 5 |
| Revised | Nov-18 | 1.122 | 9 | 1.757 | 25 | 3.566 | 24 | 3.743 | 25 | 3.673 | 25 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Jul-18 Identify Savings | Jan-18 | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 1.757 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | 0.146 | | | | 1.318 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.146) | (0.146) | (0.146) | (0.439) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.146) | (0.293) | (0.439) | (0.439) |

Frequency of Update to Actuals: PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: Quarterly

Tracking No. LIRR 18-14

No

PEG Name: Operating Funded Capital

PEG Description: With significant infrastructure investment over the next several years and limited resource and track availability, anticipate reduced need for Operating Funded Capital.

PEG Status: OFC funding reduced.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 22 | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 2.000 | | 2.000 | | 2.000 | | 2.000 | | 2.000 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| Jul-18 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | Duic | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | MONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 2.000 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | | | | 1.500 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.167) | (0.167) | (0.167) | (0.500) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.167) | (0.333) | (0.500) | (0.500) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly Yes Tracking No. LIRR 19-01

PEG Name: Infrastructure Investment

PEG Description: Significant Infrastructure Investment along the main line (Double Track and Mainline Third Track) will result in lower maintenance material needs over the next several years.

PEG Status: Material needs reduced

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 4.155 | | 4.076 | | 3.919 | | 3.874 | | 3.874 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Jul-18 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 4.155 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | 0.346 | | | | 3.116 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.346) | (0.346) | (0.346) | (1.039) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.346) | (0.693) | (1.039) | (1.039) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly Yes Tracking No. LIRR 19-02

PEG Name: LIRR Forward Reductions

- PEG Description: Reduce enhanced car cleaning, enhanced station cleaning, usher and ambassador initiatives. The overall elements of LIRR Forward will remain, just strategically scaled back. Greater efficiencies within existing resources will be achieved. Positions reduced through attrition.
- PEG Status: All savings on target.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 1.034 | 51 | 5.978 | 51 | 5.977 | 51 | 5.978 | 51 | 5.980 | 51 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 1.034 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | 0.086 | | | | 0.776 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.086) | (0.086) | (0.086) | (0.259) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.086) | (0.172) | (0.259) | (0.259) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly

No

PEG Name: Enterprise Asset Management

PEG Description: Reduce scope to the EAM program of projects focused on Phase II EAM. LIRR will focus on restructuring the project tasks to be implemented over a longer timeline and absorption into the MTA PSI project where applicable.

PEG Status: Scope reduced. Savings on target.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 1.019 | 0 | 1.028 | 3 | 1.037 | 3 | 1.045 | 3 | 1.045 | 3 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 1.019 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | 0.085 | | | | 0.764 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.085) | (0.085) | (0.085) | (0.255) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.085) | (0.170) | (0.255) | (0.255) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly Yes Tracking No. LIRR 19-04

PEG Name: Improve efficiency of right of way maintenance

PEG Description: Improve efficiency/productivity of existing workforce. More effectively manage state of good repair program (capital program) to perform more work under state of good repair that would result in less need of materials for maintenance activities. Positions reduced through attrition.

PEG Status: Savings being achieved. Positions being reduced through attrition.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 23 |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 3.214 | 44 | 8.029 | 44 | 8.030 | 44 | 7.928 | 44 | 7.927 | 44 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | NONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 3.214 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | | | | 2.411 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.268) | (0.268) | (0.268) | (0.804) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.268) | (0.536) | (0.804) | (0.804) |

Frequency of Update to Actuals: PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: Quarterly No Tracking No. LIRR 19-05

PEG Name: East Side Access Operating Efficiencies

PEG Description: The LIRR has begun an extensive review on how to more efficiently integrate the existing LIRR service with the new service to Grand Central including operational staffing, administrative staffing, training, fleet maintenance, crew staffing, etc. Based on this initial review, savings have been identified.

PEG Status: Savings being achieved

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 7.500 | 0 | 4.500 | 0 | 9.500 | 0 | 9.500 | 0 | 9.500 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 7.500 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | 0.625 | | | | 5.625 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.625) | (0.625) | (0.625) | (1.875) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.625) | (1.250) | (1.875) | (1.875) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly Yes Tracking No. LIRR 19-06

PEG Name: Help Points

PEG Description: A more efficient approach to rolling out Help Points has been identified. Help Points will be rolled out as part of the Enhanced Station Initiatives and other capital programs (main line third track, etc.)

PEG Status: Help Points removed from the operating budget.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 23 |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 5.000 | | 5.000 | 0 | 0.000 | 0 | 0.000 | 0 | 0.000 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | NONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 5.000 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | 0.417 | | | | 3.750 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.417) | (0.417) | (0.417) | (1.250) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.417) | (0.833) | (1.250) | (1.250) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | |
|---------------------------------|--|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | |

Quarterly Yes Tracking No. LIRR 19-07

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 2019 MNR PEG Monitoring Program 3rd Quarter 2019 results

In 2019, 7 PEG's are being monitored with a full-year savings of 55 positions and \$30.0 million.

Results through the third quarter show that \$22.5 million or 100.0% of the planned PEG reductions of \$22.5 million were realized and 55 positions were reduced. Additionally, 75.0% of the planned full-year savings were realized in the second quarter.

At year-end, savings for the monitored PEG'S are projected to be \$30.0 million or 100.0% of the planned reductions and 55 positions will be reduced.

Tracking No. MNR 19-01

PEG Name: Re-allocation of Infrastructure Improvement Repairs from Operating to Capital

PEG Description: Metro-North Maintenance of Way forces perform ongoing maintenance and emergency repairs to its right-of-way. These forces also make capital improvements including replacing track and upgrading control systems. In order to make the most efficient use of available staff and minimize track outages, regular maintenance activity and capital project work are combined wherever possible. This can result in capital-funded work being classified as non-reimbursable expense. This item recognizes this issue and reallocates the capital activity performed by maintenance forces to the correct funding source.

PEG Status:

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 3.538 | | 3.538 | | 3.538 | | 3.538 | | 3.538 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 3.538 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | 0.295 | | | | 2.654 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.295) | (0.295) | (0.295) | (0.885) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.295) | (0.590) | (0.885) | (0.885) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MNR 19-02

PEG Name: Reductions to Overtime & Fringe

PEG Description: Rightsizing of overtime expense primarily in the Maintenance of Equipment Department. In the Maintenance of Equipment Department, overtime has been reduced through the implementation of enhanced Overtime Control and Authorization processes as well as improved work production efficiencies.

PEG Status:

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 4.069 | | 4.069 | | 4.069 | | 4.069 | | 4.069 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 7/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 4.069 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | 0.339 | | | | 3.052 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.339) | (0.339) | (0.339) | (1.017) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.339) | (0.678) | (1.017) | (1.017) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MNR 19-03

PEG Name: Tighter Control and Prioritization of Non-Payroll Expenses

PEG Description: Departments across Metro-North have identified budget savings related to historical spending trends and cost containment efforts. Examples of some these reductions include legal fees, environmental remediation, medical services, travel, materials and supplies, and various other maintenance and other operating contracts and professional services.

PEG Status:

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|--------|------|--------|------|--------|------|--------|------|--------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 12.531 | 0 | 16.080 | 0 | 14.905 | 0 | 13.197 | 0 | 13.197 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 11/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 1.044 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 12.534 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 1.044 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | 1.045 | | | | 9.400 | |
| Month Var. | _ | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (1.045) | (1.045) | (1.045) | (3.134) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (1.045) | (2.089) | (3.134) | (3.134) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MNR 19-04

PEG Name: Lower Energy Consumption due to ISO 500001 Requirements and Reduced Car Miles

PEG Description: In order to maintain ISO50001 Energy Management Certification, MNR is required to implement three projects per year that reduce energy consumption. In addition, due to Harlem Line track work and the White Plains Station Improvement Project, there will be reduced revenue service car miles resulting in additional energy savings.

PEG Status:

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 1.938 | 0 | 1.874 | 0 | 1.911 | 0 | 1.962 | 0 | 1.962 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 11/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 1.938 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | 0.162 | | | | 1.454 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.162) | (0.162) | (0.162) | (0.485) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.162) | (0.323) | (0.485) | (0.485) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MNR 19-05

PEG Name: Maintenance of Equipment Early Reduction of Capital Positions; Potential Furlough of 4-12 Employees

PEG Description: The Maintenance of Equipment Department will reduce full-time equivalents allocated to capital projects by 30 positions and will transition employees in those roles to operating activity to replace positions that become vacant due to projected retirements. This reduction in overall positions will result in a potential furlough of 4 to 12 employees. The Maintenance of Equipment Department will manage the actual hiring of new employees to meet the proposed 2019 savings target.

PEG Status:

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 3.215 | 30 | 0.000 | 30 | 0.000 | 30 | 0.000 | 30 | 0.000 | 30 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 11/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 3.215 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | 0.268 | | | | 2.411 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.268) | (0.268) | (0.268) | (0.804) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.268) | (0.536) | (0.804) | (0.804) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MNR 19-06

 PEG Name:
 Extend Car/Coach Cleaning Cycle from 92 to 184 days; Eliminate 25 Car Cleaner Positions and Immediate Furlough of 25

 PEG Description:
 The Maintenance of Equipment Department will implement a 184-day cycle for extensive car/coach cleaning versus the existing 92-year cycle. In order to meet this annual savings target, 25 positions will be removed from the overall department position count. This reduction in overall positions will result in the immediate furlough of 25 employees.

PEG Status:

| | , | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 2.679 | 25 | 2.733 | 25 | 2.787 | 25 | 2.843 | 25 | 2.843 | 25 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 11/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|--|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total | |
| Plan | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 2.679 | |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | 0.223 | | | | 2.009 | |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.223) | (0.223) | (0.223) | (0.670) | |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.223) | (0.447) | (0.670) | (0.670) | |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

PEG Name: Operating Capital Reduction

PEG Description: Metro-North expects savings to Operating Capital projects related to historical spending trends and cost containment efforts.

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 2.000 | 0 | 3.000 | 0 | 2.000 | 0 | 2.000 | 0 | 2.000 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 11/1/2018 Identify Savings | Jan-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 2.000 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | 0.167 | | | | 1.500 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.167) | (0.167) | (0.167) | (0.500) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.167) | (0.333) | (0.500) | (0.500) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MNR 19-07

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 2019 Bridges & Tunnels PEG Monitoring Program 3rd Quarter 2019 results

In 2019, 5 PEG's are being monitored with a full-year savings of 0 positions and \$23.3 million.

Results through the third quarter show that \$13.9 million or 100.0% of the planned PEG reductions of \$13.9 million were realized and 0 positions were reduced. Additionally, 60.0% of the planned full-year savings were realized in the third quarter.

At year-end, savings for the monitored PEG is projected to be \$23.3 million or 100.0% of the planned reductions and 0 positions will be reduced.

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: Major Maintenance and Bridge Painting

PEG Description: Approximately 25% of B&T's non-labor financial plan is dedicated to a Major Maintenance and Bridge Painting Program that supplements and supports the large construction projects carried out through the Capital Programs.

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|------------------|-----------------|------|-----------------|------|-----------------|------|-----------------|------|-----------------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 Jul-19 | 6.000 12.423 | 0 | 7.500 13.923 | | 9.000 15.423 | | 9.000 15.423 | | 9.000 15.423 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 1 | Nov-18 | 2010 | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 1.571 | 1.571 | 1.571 | 1.571 | 1.571 | 1.571 | 12.423 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 0.500 | 1.571 | 1.571 | 1.571 | - | - | - | 7.713 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | (1.571) | (1.571) | (1.571) | (4.710) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.000 | 0.001 | 0.001 | (1.569) | (3.140) | (4.710) | (4.710) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

В&Т 19-01

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: Building Services

PEG Description: B&T reduced its occupied space considerably in 2017, and the rent chargeback subsequently decreased.

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 202 | 19 | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-19 | 1.096 | 0 | 1.096 | 0 | 1.096 | 0 | 1.096 | 0 | 1.096 | 0 |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 1 | Jul-19 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | ·, |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 1.096 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | 0.091 | | | | 0.822 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.091) | (0.091) | (0.091) | (0.274) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.091) | (0.183) | (0.274) | (0.274) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. B&T 19-02

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

| PEG Name: | Cashless Tolling |
|------------------|--|
| PEG Description: | In the expectation that operating in a Cashless Tolling environment would create numerous customer service and revenue protection challenges, B&T has maintained a contingency fund to manage these risks. Now that we have over a year and a half of experience managing these cashless tolling risks we can reduce the amount in the contingency fund. B&T is confident that the amount remaining in the fund will be sufficient to address any new issues, barring unforeseen events. |
| PEG Status: | |

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| (· · · / · / | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-19 | 7.534 | 0 | 7.534 | 0 | 7.534 | 0 | 7.534 | 0 | 7.534 | 0 |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 1 | Jul-19 | | Mar-19 |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-----|-----|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | - | - | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 7.534 |
| Actual/Proj. | - | - | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | 0.753 | | | | 5.274 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.753) | (0.753) | (0.753) | (2.260) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.753) | (1.507) | (2.260) | (2.260) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

В&Т 19-03

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

| PEG Name: | Major Maintenance |
|------------------|--|
| PEG Description: | Approximately 24% of B&T's non-labor financial plan is dedicated to a Major Maintenance and Bridge Painting Program that supplements and supports the large construction projects carried out through the Capital Programs. A comprehensive re-evaluation of these supplemental needs over the July Financial Plan period has yielded savings of approximately \$6.4 million per year. |
| PEG Status: | |

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 201 | 19 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 21 | 20 | 22 | 20 | | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|--|
| | | \$ | Pos. | |
| Original Plan: | Jul-19 | 6.423 | 0 | 6.423 | 0 | 6.423 | 0 | 6.423 | 0 | 6.423 | 0 | |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| | Jul-19 | Buio | Jul-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.071 | 1.071 | 1.071 | 1.071 | 1.071 | 1.071 | 6.423 |
| Actual/Proj. | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.071 | 1.071 | 1.071 | | | | 3.212 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (1.071) | (1.071) | (1.071) | (3.212) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (1.071) | (2.141) | (3.212) | (3.212) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | (|
|---------------------------------|---|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | 1 |

Quarterly

No

B&T 19-04

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

| PEG Name: | Routine Maintenance |
|------------------|---|
| PEG Description: | B&T's Maintenance Department reviewed their routine contracts, ranging from de-icing materials to a wide array of roadway materials and facility repair services, and identified individual contract savings that totaled \$2.2 million combined. |
| PEG Status: | |

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | 20 | 19 20 | | 2020 | | 21 | 20 | 22 202 | | 23 |
|-----------------------|-------|-------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|--------|-------|------|
| | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: Jul-19 | 2.247 | 0 | 2.247 | 0 | 2.247 | 0 | 2.247 | 0 | 2.247 | 0 |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 1 | Jul-19 | | Mar-19 |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (| \$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|------------|-----------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | - | - | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 2.247 |
| Actual/Proj. | - | - | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | 0.225 | | | | 1.573 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.225) | (0.225) | (0.225) | (0.674) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.225) | (0.449) | (0.674) | (0.674) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

В&Т 19-05

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 2019 MTA HQ PEG Monitoring Program 3rd Quarter 2019 results

In 2019, 5 PEG's are being monitored with a full-year savings of 61 positions and \$26.6 million.

Results through the first quarter show that \$20.0 million or 100.0% of the planned PEG reductions of \$20.0 million were realized and 61 positions were reduced. Additionally, 75.0% of the planned full-year savings were realized in the first quarter.

At year-end, savings for the monitored PEG is projected to be \$26.6 million or 100.0% of the planned reductions and 61 positions will be reduced.

2018 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: Reduction of Consultant Usage and Software Needs

PEG Description: A thorough and expansive examination of the need for consultant services by MTA IT has resulted in a reduction of levels that were previously assumed as well as reduced software costs.

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-18 | 2.741 | | 7.148 | | 7.148 | | 7.148 | | 7.148 | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Identify Savings | Jul-18 | | Jul-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 7.148 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | 0.596 | - | - | - | 5.361 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.596) | (0.596) | (0.596) | (1.787) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.596) | (1.191) | (1.787) | (1.787) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quart |
|---------------------------------|-------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

MTA HQ Tracking No. 18-02

terly

2018 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: Excess Genius Challenge Funding

PEG Description: Excess Genius Challenge Funding

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 1.500 | | 5.100 | | 5.100 | | 5.100 | | 5.100 | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Nov-18 | | Jul-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 5.100 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | 0.425 | - | - | - | 3.825 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.425) | (0.425) | (0.425) | (1.275) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.425) | (0.850) | (1.275) | (1.275) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MTA HQ 18-05

2018 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: MTA IT Vacancies

PEG Description: Elimination of inactive vacancies

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2018 | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 2.495 | 0 | 7.640 | 61 | 7.835 | 61 | 8.037 | 61 | 8.244 | 61 |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Nov-18 | | Oct-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 7.640 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | 0.637 | - | - | - | 5.730 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.637) | (0.637) | (0.637) | (1.910) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.637) | (1.273) | (1.910) | (1.910) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MTA HQ 18-06

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: MTA IT Initiatives

PEG Description: Elimination of IT initiatives fund

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 2.806 | 0 | 3.000 | 0 | 3.000 | 0 | 3.000 | 0 | 3.000 | 0 |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Jan-18 | | Jan-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | /ONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 2.806 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | 0.234 | - | - | - | 2.105 |
| Month Var. | 0.000 | 0.000 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.234) | (0.234) | (0.234) | (0.701) |
| YTD Var. | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0.000 | (0.234) | (0.467) | (0.701) | (0.701) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MTA HQ 19-01

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: MTAPD - Homeless outreach overtime

PEG Description: Total elimination of homeless outreach overtime

PEG Status:

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 3.946 | 0 | 3.946 | 0 | 3.946 | 0 | 3.946 | 0 | 3.946 | 0 |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|------------------------------|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| Nov-18 Identify Savings | Jan-18 | | Jan-18 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | IONTHLY CASH SAVINGS: (\$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 3.946 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | 0.329 | - | - | - | 2.960 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.329) | (0.329) | (0.329) | (0.987) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.329) | (0.658) | (0.987) | (0.987) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MTA HQ 19-02

Metropolitan Transportation Authority 2019 MTA Bus PEG Monitoring Program 3rd Quarter 2019 results

In 2019, 3 PEG's are being monitored with a full-year savings of 45 positions and \$6.7 million.

Results through the third quarter show that \$5.0 million or 100.0% of the planned PEG reductions of 7.5 million were realized and 45 positions were reduced. Additionally, 75.0% of the planned full-year savings were realized in the second quarter.

At year-end, savings for the monitored PEG is projected to be \$6.7 million or 100.0% of the planned reductions and 45 positions will be reduced.

The following PEG has been removed from the 3rd quarter savings target:

- 19-03 Express Bus Service Adjustment
 - The express bus service adjustment has been cancelled in the 3rd Quarter. This PEG will be re-evaluated once the Bus Network Redesign is complete.

MTA Bus Company

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: Maintenance Hourly Reduction

PEG Description: Hourly reduction: 7 Maintainers, 2 Helpers, 2 Cleaners

PEG Status: This PEG has been implemented through the 3rd Quarter.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 202 | 19 | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-17 | 1.145 | 11 | 1.168 | 11 | 1.193 | 11 | 1.216 | 11 | 1.216 | 11 |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|--|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 1 Hourly positions eleminated from Budget. | Jul-18 | | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 1.145 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | | | | 0.859 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.095) | (0.095) | (0.095) | (0.286) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.095) | (0.191) | (0.286) | (0.286) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MTA Bus

MTA Bus Company

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

 PEG Name:
 Shop Overhaul Program

 PEG Description:
 Preliminary Shop Program, still being finalized. Transition to a 6 year overhaul replacing the prior overhaul schedule where possible.

PEG Status: This PEG has been implemented through the 3rd Quarter.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|----------------|--------|-------|------|-------|------|-------|------|--------|------|--------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Jul-17 | 5.574 | 34 | 4.062 | 25 | 8.641 | 52 | -5.803 | -25 | -5.803 | -25 |

| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Planned Date | Revised Date | Actual Date |
|---|-----------------|-----------------|----------------|
| 1 Transition to a 6 year overhaul replacing the prior 4 and 8 year overhaul schedule. | Jul-18 | Bate | Jan-19 |
| | | | |
| | | | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (\$ | in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|--------------|--------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|---------|---------|---------|---------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 5.574 |
| Actual/Proj. | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | 0.465 | | | | 4.181 |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.465) | (0.465) | (0.465) | (1.394) |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | (0.465) | (0.929) | (1.394) | (1.394) |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

MTA Bus 19-02

MTA Bus Company

2019 PEG Monitoring Milestone Report 3rd Quarter 2019 (Actuals through September)

PEG Name: Express Bus Service Adjustment

PEG Description: Ridership-based weekday and weekend service adjustments

PEG Status: The express bus service adjustment has been cancelled in the 3rd Quarter. This PEG will be re-evaluated once the Bus Network Redesign is complete.

PEG VALUE: (\$ in millions)

| | | 2019 | | 2020 | | 2021 | | 2022 | | 2023 | |
|-------------------|--------|---------|------|---------|------|---------|------|---------|------|---------|------|
| | | \$ | Pos. |
| Original Plan: | Nov-18 | 10.001 | 41 | 21.008 | 81 | 21.044 | 81 | 21.078 | 81 | 21.089 | 81 |
| Plan Cancellation | Sep-19 | -10.001 | -41 | -21.008 | -81 | -21.044 | -81 | -21.078 | -81 | -21.089 | -81 |
| | - | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | Planned | Revised | Actual |
|--|---------|---------|--------|
| CRITICAL TASKS & MILESTONES: | Date | Date | Date |
| 1 Ridership-based weekday and weekend adjustments. 7 of 43 routes completely eliminated. Hours of service | Nov-18 | | Nov-18 |
| reductions. Saturday and/or Sunday full service discontinuations, weekend consolidations of nearby routes. | | | |
| 2 Express Service adjustment will be re-evaluated once the Bus Network Redesign is complete. | | 19-Sep | |
| | | • | |

| MONTHLY CASH | SAVINGS: (| \$ in millions) | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------|------------|-----------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|---------|---------|---------|---------|----------|
| | Jan | Feb | Mar | Apr | May | Jun | Jul | Aug | Sep | Oct | Nov | Dec | Total |
| Plan | | | | | | | | | (2.500) | (2.500) | (2.500) | (2.500) | (10.001) |
| Actual/Proj. | | | | | | | | | (2.500) | (2.500) | (2.500) | (2.500) | (10.001) |
| Month Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | _ | _ | - | - |
| YTD Var. | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |

| Frequency of Update to Actuals: | Quarterly |
|---------------------------------|-----------|
| PEG Has Been Fully Implemented: | No |

Tracking No. MTA Bus