

Paratransit Advisory Committee (PAC)

September 29, 2022

Meeting Minutes

Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic, the PAC meeting date, time, and format was changed. A Zoom virtual meeting was conducted.

Meeting was called to order by Shirley Teran-Marty, PAC Liaison at 5:00pm.

Attendees on Conference Call:

PAC Members - Thomas Coppola, Luda Demikhovskaya, Sharlene Kraft, Ketrina Hazell, Jose Hernandez, Billy Mitchell, Mark Anthony Phifer, Jean Ryan, Tucker Salovaara, Sharada Veerubhotla, RueZalia Watkins

Absent - Mindy Jacobson, Ellen Rubin

MTA/NYCT Paratransit – Shari Bhushun-Ogbourne, Lynda Edmond, Tammie Francisque, Donna Fredericksen, Eugene Griffith, Simone Harvard, Robin Hernandez, Patricia Ibarguen, Diane McFarlane, Chris Pangilinan, Nathasha Parris, Donald Raimondi, Shirley Teran-Marty

Approval of Minutes

Ms. Watkins, PAC Chair conducted the meeting. A motion was made to approve the previous meeting minutes.

Access-A-Ride (AAR) Service Report

Vice President Chris Pangilinan

A summary of the July 2022 operating statistics from the Paratransit Report was sent to PAC members. VP Pangilinan provided the July statistics. A copy of the report is on page 6.

Paratransit Topic: Supplemental Carriers- DVP Raimondi

DVP Raimondi cited how AAR has implemented three supplemental services as a dedicated gap filler service for primary carriers. We have D&J they provide cutaway “lift equipped” vehicles and have the name “City Care” on them but they also have the Access-A-Ride logo, the second is VGM which provide TLC WAV vehicles and GoGo which also have cutaway “lift equipped” vehicles. All vendors providing this service are required to have the AAR logo on the vehicle at all times when providing this service.

VP Pangilinan expressed the idea of supplemental service is a great way to add more drivers, vehicles, and capacity when there is a driver shortage.

PAC Member Discussion and Feedback

Mr. Phifer asked if his previous suggestion and partnering with Accessible Dispatch was being considered? VP Pangilinan mentioned that he had an upcoming meeting with the Commissioner to discuss a few topics including accessible dispatch and see what possibilities there is in increasing reliability.

Ms. Ryan asked if D&J and GOGO BUS drivers are trained on securing wheelchair and customers. DVP Raimondi assured that these drivers do get similar training as AAR driver and are familiar with the population that travel with AAR. At the current moment we are

operating 30-35 vehicles per day in total from this supplemental service. They each complete 7 trips a day, which on average can service a total 200 trips a day.

Ms. Hazell asked if E-hail customers are unable to book a trip can they get this supplemental service? Can we get some pictures of the vehicles? DVP Raimondi explained that this service isn't necessarily for E-hail unless a customer calls the Command Center, and accommodation may be considered.

Ms. Watkins inquired when does a customer know they will get this supplemental service? How can customers identify that these vehicles? DVP Raimondi clarified that the vehicle would show up as a regular scheduled trip and additional details will be featured in the Fall version of the On-The-Move. A customer will get a notification that they will receive this vehicle and all the vehicles must display the AAR logo.

PAC Topic: The status of the E-hail On-Demand and Scheduling Process - VP Pangilinan

VP Pangilinan detailed how Phase 1 of the E-hail Pilot Program began in 2017 with 1,200 participants. This was supposed to end the June 30 and we extended it to the end of December 2022. We are in the developing Phase II; the goal is to expand the program to more customers. The proposed Phase II, which was discussed in February (2020) right before the pandemic, was to extend it to 2,400 people and 16 trips with a \$15.00 cap. He would like to expand the program and design something more suitable and hopes to provide further details next month.

PAC Member Discussion and Feedback

Ms. Veerubhotla asked what are we doing for the lack of service availability? There has been an increase of E-hail customers that are being stranded. Customer call and must wait 45 minutes and after that are being told they do not have drivers and unable to accommodate the trip. VP Pangilinan empathized since he has encountered this as well. The way phase I was developed had a fundamental flaw which didn't get exposed until after the pandemic and this wasn't anyone fault. The established prices for AAR trip were fixed which was suitable before the pandemic however after the pandemic the market for for-hired vehicle are short 20%. The demand for service has increased and now AAR customer is competing against everybody to schedule a trip and TLC is paying more.

In Phase II we want to remove a fixed price but the downside to this that is Phase II has a cap so a customer might exceed the pricing. We also want to allow customers to choose any of the three providers on their app when booking a trip.

Ms. Ryan wanted to know how long would Phase II last? This will be a 1-year Pilot.

Ms. Demikhovskaya is not pleased with the allotted time given to make an appointment time reservation? Officer of Customer Relations, Ms. Ibarquen responded that since last month customers can call anytime within 7am-5pm and schedule an appointment time or use the app.

VP Pangilinan also added that reservation time are FTA guidelines which stated that any trips that AAR offer must be made during business hours the day before.

Mr. Phifer mentioned how nervous he is that one of these days when he calls E-hail and they might tell him they do not have a vehicle available. What is the contingency plan if there isn't any vehicle who is going to assistance me? VP Pangilinan said customer can call

Command Center at #5 but these contingency plans are being considered in the second phase.

Ms. Watkins also was concern on how recovery trips take place for E-hail? Command Center Officer, Mr. Harvard stated whenever there is a stranded customer on regular scheduled trips or E-hail equal priority is given to find a trip. If there are available vehicles wait time might vary.

New/Old Business

Ms. Watkins wants to look at strategies where we AAR and PAC to find solutions to how we can help assist all aspect of the service.

Mr. Mitchel wants to discuss how we can improve customer service training for drivers.

The next PAC meeting will be December 1, 2022.

Closing

The meeting was adjourned at 6:30pm.

Paratransit Report

Statistical results for the month of July 2022 are shown below.

Paratransit Operations - Monthly Operations Report Service Indicators							
Category	Performance Indicator	Current Month: July 2022			12-Month Average		
		This Year	Last Year	% Change	This Year	Last Year	% Change
Ridership	Total Trips Completed*	535,815	476,408	+12.5%	488,262	469,053	+4.1%
	Total Ridership	778,821	677,176	+15.0%	695,763	637,618	+9.1%
On-Time Performance	Pick-up Primary 30 Minute	97.0%	92.0%	+5.0%	93.8%	96.5%	-2.7%
	Pick-up Primary 15 Minute	88.0%	81.0%	+7.0%	82.5%	88.7%	-6.2%
	Pick-up Broker 30 Minute	94.0%	89.0%	+5.0%	90.5%	95.6%	-5.1%
	Pick-up Broker 15 Minute	81.0%	72.0%	+9.0%	75.4%	84.6%	-9.2%
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Primary - Early*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - 30 Min Early to <1 Late (On-Time)*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Appointment OTP Trips Broker - Early*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Ride Time	Ride Time Variance Performance: Actual Trip Duration vs. Planned Trip Duration - At or Better Than Plan	83.0%	81.0%	+2.0%	80.2%	86.2%	-6.0%
	Average Actual Trip Duration in Minutes	36	34	+5.9%	36	29	+23.8%
	Max Ride Time Performance Primary	98.0%	99.0%	-1.0%	98.1%	99.0%	-0.9%
	Max Ride Time Performance Broker	99.0%	99.0%	0.0%	98.6%	99.0%	-0.4%
Customer Experience	Frequent Rider Experience Primary*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
	Frequent Rider Experience Broker*	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a
Provider No-Shows	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Primary	0.80	3.31	-75.6%	2.50	1.25	+100.8%
	Provider No-Shows per 1,000 Schedule Trips Broker	3.70	5.45	-32.1%	5.15	1.70	+202.0%
Customer Complaints	Passenger Complaints - Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	1.8	7.5	-76.0%	4.3	2.8	+51.9%
	Passenger Complaints - Non-Transportation Service Quality Per 1000 Completed Trips	3.4	3.5	-2.9%	3.3	1.4	+134.5%
Call Center	Percent of Calls Answered	95.0%	86.0%	+9.0%	90.9%	93.8%	-2.8%
	Average Call Answer Speed in Seconds	62	233	-73.4%	141	86	+64.5%
Eligibility	Total Registrants	171,236	165,008	+3.8%	167,442	162,090	+3.3%

*NOTE: The Drop-off On-Time Performance and Customer Experience metrics are not available to present monthly data comparison due to the temporary suspension of appointment time booking of trips associated with the COVID-19 pandemic which started in March 2020. Consequently, the current 12-Month Average rate for these two metrics cannot be calculated.

Note: 1) The percentage comparisons are the percentage point change instead of the percentage change.
2) Trip data and resulting metrics are preliminary and subject to adjustments.